regarding the essential purpose of the missionaries of the London-based Society, and the prospect of an appointment of an American bishop.

Pownalborough’s parson was a visible representative of the old order that prompted New England settlers to flee England in the 1620s and 1630s. But the changed civil circumstances of the 1770s led to the second contentious issue in dispute. Because Bailey was a minister of the English Church, he was a target for disparagement by opponents of imperial policies. The members of the local Committee of Public Safety authorized by the First Continental Congress subjected him to examination to determine whether he was a patriot or Loyalist. Bailey’s vulnerable position was shaped by a sense of moral duty. On the occasion of his ordination in London, he was required to swear an oath of loyalty to the supremacy of the Crown and parliament. In the drift of increasing civil protest, he could not and would not forfeit that obligation. The diligent parson’s congregation loyally and firmly supported him during the turbulent proceedings, but finally in 1779 Bailey and his family sought political refuge in Nova Scotia.

More than two centuries after Bailey’s death in Annapolis, Nova Scotia, an accomplished scholar of Maine’s early history has deftly revisited Bailey’s life and career. The foundation of this excellent work is an extraordinary and extensive cache of Bailey’s personal papers, unpublished essays, and poems that are deposited in several libraries. It is at once an admirable first-class biography and an informative glimpse of the impact of disruptive affairs on the lives of individuals who embraced a minority view on civil issues. The book also is a strong, valuable, and engaging social history of a turbulent period in Anglo-American history.

_Rothermere American Institute_  
*University of Oxford*  

**James B. Bell**


The nineteenth-century American Protestant mission to the Hawaiian Islands has been the subject of a wide range of histories seeking to shed light not only on this evangelical by-product of the Second Great Awakening but also on the social, political, and economic development of the Hawaiian Kingdom. Clifford Putney has added to this important discussion of transnational history a new work that offers a detailed look inside the lives of the missionary couple Peter and Fanny Gulick. The biography aims to offer significant information on these American evangelical agents and their influence within a foreign land, while addressing historiographical issues within the field of missiology that have created a problematic paradigm for the study of missionary families.
Putney explains the relevance of his book’s subjects by writing, “Of all the reform-minded families in American history, few were more active than the Gulicks” (p. 1), and noting the broader family’s 140-year service to foreign missions. Peter and Fanny, the founders of this evangelical clan, arrived in the Hawaiian Islands in 1828 as members of the third company of Protestant missionaries sent by the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions (ABCFM). In addition to the prolific record-keeping that often characterized these missions, the couple and their extended family produced and retained a vast collection of personal papers, making them, according to the author, “one of the best-documented middle-class families in American history” (p. 6). Putney accesses this material to bring the story of the Gulicks to the reader with detail, offering vivid description of their lives and their interactions with a people very foreign to these New Jersey and Connecticut natives. The book follows the couple through chapters that act as geographic markers of the differing mission stations where the Gulicks were assigned. This serves the overall narrative well, especially when the work allows for rich depictions of the kuahibiei (mountains), kahawai (rivers), and other natural features of these areas that were so prominent in the lives of their native inhabitants. Putney’s significant knowledge concerning the ABCFM and the evangelical movements of the period lend context to the writing, especially in areas such as when offering background on the Calvinism that motivated Peter and Fanny.

The book’s sourcing is one of its strengths, but it also raises questions that are at the fore of a leading, current historiographical issue in nineteenth-century Hawaiian history. The Gulicks lived and worked in a foreign nation amidst a native population that by the 1860s was nearly fully literate and who produced a prolific collection of writing about their lives, their land, and their lābui (nation). During the nineteenth century, there were nearly 100 Hawaiian-language newspapers published in the islands; the first in 1834. This prolific collection, nearly 125,000 over-sized pages, makes up only a part of the varied native-language source material available today. Additionally, the local mission institution to which the Gulicks belonged after 1854, the ‘Ahahui ‘Euanelio o Hawai‘i (Hawaiian Evangelical Association), printed all reports and records in Hawaiian and in English. The English-language annual reports, produced for the ABCFM, regularly differed from the native-language versions, often substantially. Although histories on nineteenth-century Hawai‘i sourced exclusively from English-language materials have added and will continue to add tremendously to our understanding of the islands of that period, any text that seeks to shed—as the book’s publisher expresses it—“new light on the democratization of government, the spread of capitalism, and the privatization of land” without accessing the native-language archive must be clear about what voice it is offering and what has been left behind.

Putney raises his own important historiographical issue by pointing to the need for complex, balanced histories of the mission and missionaries that are neither hagiographic nor strictly condemnatory. In his text, the author does
not shy away from critiques of the Gulicks; admitting that “their religious zeal and cultural parochialism acted as blinders, preventing them from seeing much value in traditional Hawaiian society” (p. 157). Putney also makes note of the “racist (and now thoroughly discredited)” (p. 9) theory of social Darwinism to which many within the later mission subscribed. He manages, however, to portray the couple as complex characters, ones who had steadfastly committed their lives to a cause in which their sincere belief was unquestionable. Putney’s biography of the Gulicks adds important knowledge about missionary lives in Hawai‘i to previous understandings. Contextualized as a view of Hawai‘i from English-language sources, it is a recommended read.

University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa

RONALD WILLIAMS JR.


Kathleen Holscher’s book, Religious Lessons: Catholic Sisters and the Captured Schools Crisis in New Mexico, although burdened with a bulky title, is a lucid and engaging presentation of a complex event. Holscher directs attention to a bitter New Mexico quarrel that flared between Catholics and Protestants over the public school employment of sisters garbed in religious habits. The author argues that in post–World War II society, Americans, with time to rethink their positions about the separation of church and state, created a watershed moment in long-standing tensions between Protestants and Catholics. In concert with other postwar cultural transformations, the New Mexico legal case influenced substantive alterations in national Catholic-Protestant relations that persist to modern times.

Drawing on a plethora of Catholic and Protestant primary sources, conducting personal interviews, examining newspapers, and delving deeply into legal records, trial transcripts, and constitutional law, Holscher crafted an impressive analytical narrative. Such an assortment of administrative and political detail with legal interpretations as a dominant theme, suggested a page-by-page challenge to the reader’s attention. Instead, Holscher produced a fascinating legal history, weaving into the prose the poignant voices of the participants.

The six chapters include an explanation of how Catholic sisters came to be public school teachers in New Mexico villages populated by Hispano families, until an influx of Anglo-Protestants altered the demographics; the attitudes, positive and negative, toward the sisters, as Protestants and Catholics increased their mutual religious hostility; and a portrait of the curriculum and atmosphere inside a public classroom overseen by a Catholic sister. The book then discusses the organized Protestant resistance, led in Dixon, New Mexico, by Lydia Zellers and at the national level by an organization known commonly